Power in Development Bibliography:

Power:

Flyvbjerg, B (1998) *Rationality and Power: Democracy in Practice*, Chicago: University of Chicago Press

Central argument: asymmetry between rationality and power forms the basic weakness in modernity and modern democracy (P.2). He argues for a focus on 'what is actually done' in democracies, rather than the more common 'what should be done' (P.3) The majority of the book is an ethnography of the politics/admin/planning process of a Danish town. He concludes that the 'rationality of power' is more prevalent in modern democracies that the 'power of rationality'. He outlines 10 statements to support this conclusion on P. 226. He argues that rationality is a weak form of power and therefore democracy built on rationality is weak too.

Relevance to power cube: his arguments that power defines reality (P.226) and that rationality is context-dependent (and that context is power) (P.2) refer, I think, to invisible power – the power to define what is rational.

He also argues that in open confrontations (claimed power?) rationality yields to power (P.226) which may make using rational arguments in such spaces less effective?

Haugaard, M. (2002) (Ed.) *Power: A Reader*, Manchester: Manchester University Press

Overview of all the main theorists of power.

Scott, J. (2001) *Power*, Cambridge: Polity Press

Overview of the concept power – looking at main theorists (Lukes/Giddens/Weber etc.). Looks at elites and sovereignty, pluralism and decision making, hegemony and discipline.

Relevance to power cube: I think chapter 6 is most relevant on collective mobilisation – outlines theories of organised protest.

P.122 Ways social movements choose to act – tactical use of structures (invited and formal spaces?).

P.126 importance of legitimacy of social movements (within invited/formal spaces).

P.131 The need for transnational advocacy networks (global-local).

Heyman, J. (2003) 'The inverse of power', *Anthropological Theory* 3(2): 139-156

This article outline's Wolf's approach to power. The author argues that structural power identified in most ethnographic studies does not depict the full extent of power. He argues that the values and position of the analyst will colour their view of what structural power is and therefore comparisons to other possible states of affairs arising from the analyst's values are needed. This is inverse power – 'counterpart ideals' that illustrate power's presence by contrasts. He argues for analysts to be open and thorough about values and ideals (P.145)

Relevance to power cube: Not sure how relevant specifically, but an interesting discussion of how ethnographies should be more positive and open about the values and ideals that lie behind them.

Gender/Power:

Kabeer, N. (1994) *Reversed Realities: Gender Hierarchies in Development Thought*, London: Verso

Chapter 9 discusses various empowerment strategies utilized by NGOs. It discusses strategies for developing 'power within', 'power with', and 'power to'. In all cases Kabeer highlights the importance given to how the needs of women are identified – empowerment should be opening up new possibilities to women (challenging visible/hidden/invisible power that previously curtailed those possibilities).

Kabeer, N. (2001) 'Resources, Agency , Achievements: Reflections on the Measurement of Women's Empowerment' in B. Sevefjord, B. Olsson, N. Kabeer, P. McFadden, S. Arnfred, E. Dominguez, and S. Saadallah (Eds.) *Discussing women's empowerment: theory and practice*, SIDA Studies

This chapter assesses the feasibility of several studies which have attempted to measure women's empowerment. Kabeer defines empowerment as the ability to make choices, but adds the caveat that this is dependent on resources, agency and achievement. These 3 dimensions must be triangulated in order for empowerment to have occurred (P.40).

Relevance to power cube: Interesting discussion on internalised power (P.24-25) which may prevent women from becoming empowered and the need for critical consciousness.

Mukhopadhyay, M. and Meer, S. (2004) *Creating voice and carving space*, Royal Tropical Institute (KIT)

This book outlines several case studies of action research looking at how women can participate in governance and how to create greater accountability in governance institutions to women. The case studies take an overtly political stance being explicit about the power relations that are at play in each case.

Relevance to power cube: Each case study has some elements that are relevant. Sri Lanka example of electing female representatives demonstrates the hidden and invisible power that operates at local and national levels in formal spaces (P. 82-84). India example of influencing planning processes shows hostility towards women elected representatives in formal and invited spaces (visible and hidden power) (P.115-116). South Africa example of law reform demonstrates the challenging of customary law (hidden power) in claimed spaces (P.151-152).

Parpart, J. L., Rai, S. and Staudt, K. A. (2002) (Eds.) *Rethinking empowerment: gender and development in a global/local world*, London: Routledge

Central theme: Empowerment (of women) must be analysed in global and national, as well as local terms (P.3-4)

Intro gives good overview of main theories of power and argues these should be brought together (P.7)

P.13-14 Argues that global power is now influencing the lives of women, yet women are relatively under-represented at the global level (heads of IFIs/MNCs/govs/UN etc.) and therefore in order to become empowered women need to engage with global politics.

Relevance to power cube: most chapters are very relevant, although I think the three chapters in Part 2 are interesting because they discuss how women can engage with global power (particularly chapter 5 which argues that the internet is enabling truly local/global connections and challenges to power).

Local-Global Power:

Abrahamsen, R. (2004) 'The power of partnerships in global governance', *Third World Quarterly* 25(8): 1453-1467

This article analyses the New Partnership for African Development (NEPAD) as a form of governability (self discipline). It uses Foucault's understanding of governability to show how partnerships cannot be understood using the concept of power as domination alone.

Relevance to power cube: Interesting way at looking at the self-monitoring aspect of NEPAD as a form of governability (as Foucault understood this term). Could be understood as the invisible power of liberal discourse creating the structures by which countries are judged within NEPAD?

Long, N. (2000) 'Exploring local/global transformations' in A. Arce & N. Long (Eds.) *Anthropology, development, and modernities: exploring discourses, counter-tendencies, and violence*, London: Routledge

This chapter takes an actor-oriented approach to look at how globalisation has been 'relocalised' (P.188) within national, regional or local frameworks. It investigates the emergence of new identifications, alliances and 'spaces' for struggles in specific arenas (p.189).

Relevance to power cube: Interesting discussion on 'arenas' (P. 192) (transcending local/national/global). Discussion of 'collective actors' (P.195) and the heterogeneous make up of actor-networks – wrong to 'black box entities (such as global institutions) (P.196). Para beginning "These various social" on P.197 argues that organisational networks represent places of conflict and interests.

Chowdhry, G. and Nair, S. (2004) 'Introduction: Power in a postcolonial world: race, gender, and class in international relations' in G. Chowdhry and S. Nair (Eds.) *Power, Postcolonialism and International Relations: Reading race, gender and class* London: Routledge

This chapter introduces the book which is a series of case studies that challenge and critique traditional international relations (IR) theories from a postcolonial perspective. This chapter outlines Marxist and Feminist critiques of IR theories before outlining how postcolonial critiques bring ideas of race and representation into IR theories. It also outlines how resistance and agency is understood in postcolonial studies.

Relevance to power cube: Not obviously relevant, but still some interesting points re. how to understand power within IR which could be relevant to your ideas on global, national and local places.

P.16 "We explore several specific sites where power is enacted in and through the representation of postcolonial others, and is manifested in relations of domination and subordination, hegemony and resistance" Looking at invisible power at the global level in institutional spaces.

I think chapter 3 looks like it may be most relevant – looking at how representations of race influenced the immigration policy of America. It examines "multiple forces that operate at both the domestic and global levels to configure identities." P.79

This could be invisible power operating at local/national/global levels within the institutionalised process of immigration.

*Friedman, J. (1990) 'Being in the World: Globalisation and Localization', in M. Featherstone (ed.) *Global culture: nationalism, globalization and modernity*, London: Sage

This article explores ways in which identity and the self is created through consumerism and modernity. It uses two case studies (Les sapeurs in the DRC and the Ainu in Japan) to illustrate this.

I am not sure this is relevant to the power cube as it is exploring how identity is formed through globalisation rather than power relations. However, the use of symbols and identity formation that transgress the local could be regarded as a form of claimed space.

Furgeson, J. (1998) *Transnational Topographies of Power: Beyond "the State" and "Civil Society" in the Study of African Politics,* Irvine: University of California

This article questions the traditional vertical topography of power with global at the top and local at the bottom. Furgeson argues that both the State and Civil Society are increasingly transnational and therefore cannot be understood as being local or national or global anymore.

Relevance to power cube: This article is interesting in the fact that it questions the topography of local-national-global (which you also use in your power cube) and highlights the increasing transnational nature of States (due to the influence of IFIs) and Civil Society (due to INGOs). But it uses quite simplistic generalisations to make this point.

P.24 Uses example of South Africa government being constrained by transnational capital. This constrains the government from implementing genuine socialist policies. This could be an example of global hidden/invisible power constraining national governments?

P.25 Furgeson calls for a foreign policy of working class civil society to challenge global hidden power. A global claimed space. Social movements are then not 'below' but 'across' (P.26-7).

Goodhart, M. (2005) 'Civil Society and the Problem of Global Democracy', *Democratization* 12(1): 1-21

This article analyses whether global civil society can provide an adequate model for global democracy from a conceptual level (it is not interested in the potential contributions global civil society can make to global democracy). It outlines two models of civil society which have been used to claim that global civil society can be a model of global democracy; the Neo-Torcquevillian model and Anti-Authoritarian model. It argues that the assumptions behind both models fall down at the global level. In the former it argues that "civil society strategies that help to reinforce democracy within the state – participation, deliberation and the like – lack the conceptual and institutional grounding [at a global level] on which their democratic functions and effects depend." (P.10) In the latter, it argues that it "this mechanism seems improbable at the global level because the links between individuals and specific IGOs are less direct and because lack of autonomous political space is not really the problem." (P.14) It concludes that the problem lies in the statist assumptions made by models of civil society which cannot hold at the supranational level. The conclusion is that we have little understanding of what democracy means without the Wesphalian notion of the state, and therefore we need a new theory pf global democracy that does not just impose existing democratic theory onto the global context (p.17).

Relevance to power cube: This article is extremely relevant. It is problematizing global civil society (claimed spaces at a global level) as a model for global democracy. Participation (in claimed/invited/formal spaces) has a very different effect and relationship to inter-governmental organisations at the global level than it does at the national level (P.8-9). Global civil society has no shared solidarity as diverse regimes affect differently situated people in different ways (P.13), therefore visible/hidden/invisible power can create very different effects for different people and create disjunctures in global consensus. This article raises problems for extending the power cube to the global level.

Keck, M. E. and Sikkink, K. (1998) *Activists Beyond Borders: Advocacy Networks in International Politics,* Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press

This book looks at the phenomenon of trans-national advocacy networks. It analyses what qualifies as a trans-national advocacy network (P.16) and what makes one successful (P.25). It provides three case studies, human rights networks in Latin America, environmental networks working on deforestation, and international networks against violence against women.

Relevance to power cube: Each case study includes an analysis of the power asymmetries and relations that exist within the trans-national networks and attempts to mitigate these or possible solutions to them. They also analyse the implications of world politics (power relations) of these new more horizontal networks. The conclusion gives a succinct overview of their main arguments.

Moore, H. L. (2004) 'Global anxieties', *Anthropological Theory*, 4(1): 71-88

This article considers how anthropology theorizes the interconnections between the local and the global. It argues both terms are 'concept-metaphors' and cannot be easily identified in reality. The author argues that anthropologists need to move away from an ethnographic focus on the 'local' and 'methodologize' the relation between the global and the local.

Relevance to power cube: The idea that local and global are concept metaphors – heuristic devices (P.73) is relevant to the power cube's use of the terms. What is meant be each in reality and can they be separated? (P.72)

P.76 Ideas of resistance/submission – examines how the local resists or adapts to the global – the global can only be understood in its local appropriation. Can global power only be understood in its local appropriation? E.g. World Bank policies can only be understood in relation to their local manifestation.

P.78 "The local is not about taxonomies, bounded cultures and social units, but about contested fields of social significance and interconnection, flows of people, ideas, images and goods."

P.81 "The key point here is that global is not just about how globalization operates as an alien and inexorable force, but it is also about how people – individuals and groups – engage with the global and make themselves global and local."

Claiming spaces in global/local and challenging global power with local interpreations?

Power and Development Institutions:

Eyben, R. (2004) 'Linking Power and Poverty Reduction, in R. Alsop (Ed.) *Power, rights and poverty: concepts and connections*: Report from a working meeting on power, rights and poverty: sponsored by DFID and the World Bank, Washington: World Bank

I'm sure you know this article. Case study of power structures in Bolivia where previously untouchable subject is forced onto the agenda – claiming space and challenging hidden power at a national level.

Hughes, A., Wheeler, J. and Eyben, R. (2005) 'Rights and power: the challenge for international development agencies', *IDS Bulletin*, 36, (1)

Groves, L. and Hinton, R. (2004) (Eds.) *Inclusive aid: changing power and relationships in international development*, London: Earthscan

Introduction: Suggests adopting a complex systems approach to the understanding of the aid system (P.5). It argues for the importance of situating actors (P.6) and understanding dynamic relationships. This blurs the boundaries of the power cube as relationships can exist between created/invited/formal spaces and between global/national/local places.

Chapter 11: This provides a succinct overview of issues of power within the previous case studies. It then outlines four action domains for shifting power relations: understanding and analysing power; narrowing the gaps between words and actions; changing rules and procedures; and organizational learning and change. Throughout all these domains, the importance of personal agency and responsibility is highlighted.

Michael, S. (2004) *Undermining development: the absence of power among local NGOs in Africa*, Oxford: James Currey

This book outlines what the author believes makes a powerful local NGO: the power to "decrease, eliminate or reshape the social boundaries or constraints that affect them" P.19. This, he argues, can only be done if they have international agenda setting power (P.20). The author outlines examples of powerful local NGOs (BRAC in Bangladesh) and then outlines why there is a lack of powerful local NGOs in Africa. Finally, he outlines how local NGOs in Africa can increase their power.

Relevance to power cube: His basic argument is very relevant. That in order for local NGOs to have power they must be able to not only set their own agenda (hidden power) but also redefine how development is practiced (invisible power). They must be able to do this on a global scale, not just a local one. Finally, they must be able to engage in formal, invited AND claimed spaces in order to do this (P.32-34)

P.21 "In the NGO context…[donors] influence them to the extent that the NGO itself willingly rethinks its priorities to fit with the mould provided by donors." Example of global invisible power influencing local agendas.

P.152-156 NGOs need to be well connected globally and locally, they need to engage politically (to change hidden/invisible power), and form networks to gain a stronger voice (create spaces).

Mitra, S. K. (1992) *Power, Protest and Participation: Local Elites and the Politics of Development in India*, London: Routledge

This book looks at the role of elites in the politics of rural development in India. It examines how elites have attempted to develop local rule and been given power in the process. It asks how successful this system has been in achieving participation and social change? It examines the relationship between protest and institutionalised participation and the elites reaction to both.

Relevance to power cube: The sections which look at protect and institutionalised participation are the most relevant.

P.198 Demonstrations (claimed spaces) can be used by rational actors for the best effect – using claimed spaces to bring in formal institutions.

P.199 The ability to manoeuvre is dependent on the attitude towards authority (behavioural norms) – therefore participation is dependent on hidden and invisible power.

Rossi, B. (2004) 'Revisiting Foucauldian approaches: power dynamics in development projects', *Journal of Development Studies*, 40 (6). pp. 1-29

This article assesses the usefulness of Foucault to the study of development projects. It details an ethnographic study of a development project which the author worked as a consultant on. She finds that due to a change in the dominant discourse of development (towards participation) the previously successful project was deemed a failure. She concludes that Foucauldian approaches can help explain the underlying rationality of development projects/institutions, but they fail to address the relationship between discourse and agency in development hierarchies. She attempts to integrate the notion of discourse into a study of the dynamics of power and hierarchy in development.

Relevance to power cube: If we understand Foucault's notion of discourse as being similar to invisible power (which I am assuming you do), then this could be an example of global invisible power (the discourse of participation) being imposed on local realities and national priorities (both in formal and invited spaces).

P.24 Power depends upon how one is positioned vis-à-vis the development discourse

P.24 The arguments that took place about making to project more participatory were about the 'meaning' of participatory. Local attempts were made to bargain around the meaning.

P.26 Knowledge shapes agency, and we need 'positioned awareness'.

Storey, Andy (2000) 'The World Bank, neo-liberalism, and power: discourse analysis and implications for campaigners', *Development in Practice*, 10 (3/4)

This article attempts to explain why neo-liberal discourses have dominated the World Bank's policies. It argues that the World Bank focuses on 'technical' issues, rather than political aspects of development. It argues that the discourse of structural adjustment has been appropriated by Southern governments.

Relevance to power cube: interesting arguments about the appropriation of discourse by Southern governments on P.364.

Uses example of Ferguson's study of Lesotho to show how the State is depicted as a 'technical' aspect of development, ignoring the political aspects on P. 365

Power and Participation:

Nelson, N and Wright, S (1995) *Power and participatory development: theory and practice*, London: IT Publications

Introduction: a theoretical overview of power, empowerment and participatory research. Case studies relevant to power cube: The articles in Part 4 contain some relevant case studies: Chapter 11 outlines the problems that have arisen in user-group forestry in Nepal. It argues that the highly stratifies society in Nepal can mean indigenous forest management systems is not supported by the whole community (P. 130) (hidden power). Chapter 13 outlines the formation of a participatory water uses society in India. It demonstrates an example of when participatory principles must be compromised to fit with local hierarchies (P. 153) but also that the society became a political organisation where caste interests are bargained for and challenged 9p. 153). (formal space challenging hidden power).

Empowerment:

Alsop, R and Heinsohn, N. (2005) *Measuring Empowerment in Practice: Structuring Analysis and Framing Indicators*, Washington: World Bank Policy Research Working Paper No. 3510

This paper develops an analytical framework for measuring empowerment, which assumes empowerment will depend upon agency and opportunity structure. It then breaks

empowerment into domains (state/market/society) and levels (macro/intermediary/local). It applies this framework to several case study examples.

Relevance to power cube: This framework could be regarded as complimentary to the power cube, especially in its use of levels. However, it condenses ideas of visible/hidden/invisible power into the idea of opportunity structure. E.g. a women may want to chose to send her daughter to school but the prevailing custom is to send your son therefore her agency is constrained by the opportunity structure, i.e. the operation of prevailing customs (invisible power).